

**Expert Reviewer:**

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment
						<b>Comment</b> ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please <b>DOUBLE-CLICK</b> in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. Only <b>ONE</b> comment per row, please. **
1	11	0		0		This Chapter is the most disappointing of the whole set. It contains hardly any actual regional climate information, based on observations. Where there are observations, they are wrong. For example in Figure !!.3.4.3 on page 138 you show a temperature record for China which has now been comprehensively corrected for errors, and shows little or no warming since 1900 (See Zhou et al 2005 Acta Meteorologica Sinica Vol 19 pages 389-400). Then, in Figure 11.3.5.1 on page 138 you give uncorrected temperature records for the USA, ignoring the corrected version which is on Figure 3.2.3, which, again, shows little warming since 1930. . The rest of the the report is almost entirely devoted to speculative models, without any serious attempt to find out whether they actually work
2	11	2	3	2	3	Replace "climate change" by "changes in the climate"
3	11	2	6	2	6	Replace "climate change" by "changes in the climate"
4	11	2	8	2	8	Add at beginning "By ignoring actual climate observations altogether"
5	11	2	8	2	8	Replace "remain" by "are here chosen as"
6	11	2	9	2	9	Delete "the robust"
7	11	2	10	2	10	Replace "climate change" by "changes in the climate"
8	11	2	20	2	20	Delete " The growing"
9	11	2	20	2	20	Replace "that underlies" with "underlie"
10	11	2	20	2	21	Delete from "increases" in line 20 to "projections" in line 21
11	11	2	22	2	22	Add at beginning "Projected"
12	11	2	24	2	24	Delete "robust"
13	11	2	26	2	26	Insert before "poleward" "projected"
14	11	2	27	2	27	Delete "especially robust"
15	11	2	32	2	32	Add at beginning "projected"
16	11	2	34	2	34	Replace "climate change" by "changes in the climate"
17	11	2	39	2	39	Delete "robust"
18	11	2	40	2	40	Replace "climate change" by "changes in the climate"
19	11	2	42	2	42	Delete "strong"
20	11	2	42	2	42	Replace "climate change" by "changes in the climate"
21	11	2	53	2	53	Replace "very likely" with "projected"
22	11	2	56	2	56	Replace "robust" with "improved"
23	11	3	1	3	1	Replace "likely or possibly even very likely" with "possible"
24	11	3	3	3	3	Insert after "available" "projected"

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment
						** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please <b>DOUBLE-CLICK</b> in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. Only <b>ONE</b> comment per row, please. **
25	11	3	5	3	5	Replace "findings" by "projections"
26	11	3	6	3	6	Delete at end "in confidence"
27	11	3	7	3	7	Replace "statements" by "projections"
28	11	3	11	3	11	Delete "It is very likely that"
29	11	3	11	3	11	Replace "will occur within" by " have been projected for"
30	11	4	5	4	5	Replace "anthropogenic global climate change": by"human influences on the climate"
31	11	4	11	4	11	Replace "climate change" by "changes in the climate"
32	11	4	12	4	12	Replace "climate change" by "changes in the climate"
33	11	4	24	4	24	Add at end "But, or course, the models cannot project natural climate trends or influence"
34	11	4	29	4	29	Delete "thorough"
35	11	4	41	4	41	Insert before "climate "projected"
36	11	4	46	4	46	Replace "very likely" with "projected that"
37	11	4	48	4	48	Replace "assessed" by "projected"
38	11	4	52	4	52	Replace "indicate" with "project"
39	11	4	56	4	56	Replace "statements" by "projections"
40	11	5	2	5	2	Replace "assessed" by "projected"
41	11	5	2	5	2	Replace "are likely to" by "could"
42	11	5	4	5	4	Replace "will very likely" with "could also"
43	11	5	12	5	12	Insert after "scales" "plus a whole range of natural climate influences which are not included in these models"
44	11	5	17	5	17	Replace "climate change" by " othe changes in the climate"
45	11	5	24	5	24	Replace "climate change" by " other changes in the climate"
46	11	5	26	5	26	Replace "climate changes" by " changes in the climate"
47	11	5	26	5	26	Replace "robust" by "similar"
48	11	5	37	5	37	Replace "validation" by "evaluation"
49	11	5	50	5	50	Delete "significant"
50	11	5	52	5	52	Delete "naturally"
51	11	5	54	5	54	Replace "depict" with "project"
52	11	6	11	6	11	Replace "evaluating" by "projecting"
53	11	6	41	6	41	Replace "study" by "project"
54	11	6	46	6	46	Replace "process" by "projection"
55	11	6	46	6	46	Replace "climate-change" by "changes in climate"
56	11	6	49	6	49	Replace "climate-change" by "changes in climate"

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment
						<b>** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please <b>DOUBLE-CLICK</b> in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. Only <b>ONE</b> comment per row, please. **</b>
57	11	7	1	7	1	Replace "robust" by "improved"
58	11	7	9	7	9	Replace "climate-change" by "change in climate"
59	11	8	14	8	14	Replace "generate" by "project"
60	11	8	39	8	39	Replace "predictability" by "reliability"
61	11	8	49	8	49	Replace "climate-change" by "change in climate"
62	11	9	20	9	20	Delete "Important"
63	11	9	44	9	44	Replace "predict" with "project"
64	11	9	44	9	44	Replace "cross-validation" with "cross-evaluation"
65	11	9	56	9	56	Replace "climate-change" by "change in climate"
66	11	10	8	10	8	Replace "climate-change" by "changes in climate"
67	11	10	22	10	22	Replace "climate-change" by "changes in climate"
68	11	10	43	10	43	Replace "climate-change" by "change in climate"
69	11	10	47	10	47	Replace "climate-change" by "change in climate"
70	11	11	11	11	11	Replace "anthropogenic": by"human-induced"
71	11	12	10	12	10	Replace "climate-change" by "change in climate"
72	11	12	33	12	33	Replace "judgement" with "guesswork"
73	11	13	43	13	43	Replace "climate-change" by "change in climate"
74	11	13	44	13	44	Delete "robust"
75	11	13	45	13	45	Replace "climate-change" by "change in climate"
76	11	12	45	13	45	Replace "anthropogenic": by"human-induced"
77	11	14	1	14	1	Replace "climate-change" by "change in climate"
78	11	14	2	14	3	Replace "an assessment" with "a projection"
79	11	14	4	14	4	Replace "analysis" with "projection"
80	11	14	7	24	7	Replace "robust" by ":likely"
81	11	14	8	14	6	Replace "processes" by "projections"
82	11	14	11	14	11	Delete "likelihood"
83	11	15	22	15	23	Where are these so-called time series graphs polished and how were they obtained? They are obviously misleading, because the two examples which have been subjected to a comprehensive correction process, that for the USA, which is shown in Figure 3.2.3, and for China, which has been published by Zhou et al 2005 Acta Meteorologica Sinica Vo 19 pages 389-400 are not used here, but instead the uncorrected versions. It is highly probable that the rest would show similar loss of most "warming" as USA and China if the correction process was made

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment
						** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please <b>DOUBLE-CLICK</b> in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. Only <b>ONE</b> comment per row, please. <b>**</b>
84	11	18	5	18	5	Add at end "but these records have not been comprehensively corrected in the fashion published by US and Chinese workers"
85	11	18	8	18	8	Insert before "surface "uncorrected"
86	11	27	1	27	1	Replace "Prediction" with "Projection"
87	11	27	3	27	3	Replace "climate change" with "projected changes in climate"
88	11	27	41	27	41	Replace "is likely to" with "may be"
89	11	28	38	28	38	Replace "indicated" by "projected"
90	11	28	48	28	48	Replace "suggests" by "projected"
91	11	28	51	28	51	Replace "analysed" with "projected"
92	11	28	55	28	55	Replace "found" by "projected"
93	11	29	6	29	6	Replace "indicate" with "project"
94	11	29	11	29	11	Replace "indicate" with "project"
95	11	29	16	29	16	Replace "is very likely to" by "could"
96	11	29	19	29	19	Replace "indicated" by "projected"
97	11	29	24	29	24	Replace "indicate" with "project"
98	11	29	50	29	50	Replace "demonstrated" by "projecetd"
99	11	30	6	30	6	Replace "found" by "projected"
100	11	30	23	30	23	Replace "are also likely to" by "could also""
101	11	30	40	30	40	Replace "indicated" by "projected"
102	11	30	52	30	52	Replace "estimated" by "projected"
103	11	30	55	30	55	Replace "found" by "projected"
104	11	31	5	31	5	Replace "is likely to" by "could"
105	11	31	5	31	5	Replace "indicated" by "projected"
106	11	31	8	31	8	Replace "found" by "projected"
107	11	31	14	31	15	Replace "is very likely to" by "could"
108	11	31	21	31	21	Replace "suggested" by "projected"
109	11	31	24	31	24	Replace "reported" by "projected"
110	11	31	27	31	27	Replace "tend to indicate" by "project"
111	11	31	40	31	40	Replace "suggest" by "project"
112	11	31	45	31	45	Replace "indicated" by "projected"
113	11	31	46	31	46	Replace "consensus" with "agreement"
114	11	31	47	31	47	Replace "will" with "might"
115	11	31	51	31	51	Replace " will very likely" by "might"

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment
						<b>Comment</b> ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please <b>DOUBLE-CLICK</b> in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. Only <b>ONE</b> comment per row, please. <b>**</b>
116	11	31	54	31	54	Replace "found" by "projected"
117	11	32	1	32	1	Replace "occurred" with "was projected"
118	11	32	8	32	8	Replace "is likely to" by "may"
119	11	32	9	32	9	Replace "estimated" by "projected"
120	11	32	13	32	13	Replace "simulated" by "projected"
121	11	32	21	32	21	Replace "are likely to" by "could"
122	11	32	22	32	22	Replace "is likely to" by "could"
123	11	32	25	32	25	Replace "are very likely to" by "could"
124	11	32	26	32	26	Replace "are likely to" by "could"
125	11	32	28	32	28	Replace "is very likely to" by "could"
126	11	32	29	32	29	Replace "is likely to" by "could"
127	11	32	31	32	31	Replace "will very likely" with "possibly"
128	11	32	33	32	33	Replace "is very likely to" by "could"
129	11	32	35	32	35	Replace "is likely to" by "could"
130	11	32	40	32	40	Replace "are very likely to" by "could"
131	11	33	22	33	22	Replace "will" by "might"
132	11	34	2	34	2	Insert after "show" "multiple"
133	11	41	12	41	12	Delete "robust"
134	11	41	15	41	15	Replace "is very likely to" by "could"
135	11	41	15	41	15	Replace "is likely to" by "could"
136	11	41	18	41	18	Replace "will increase very likely" by "might increase"
137	11	41	20	41	20	Replace "will likely" by "may"
138	11	41	21	41	21	Replace "will likely" by "may"
139	11	41	22	41	22	Delete "It is very likely that"
140	11	41	22	41	22	Replace "will" by "might"
141	11	41	24	41	24	Replace "very likely" by "possible"
142	11	41	25	41	25	Replace "very likely" by "possibly"
143	11	41	27	41	27	Replace "are likely to" by "could"
144	11	50	20	50	20	Replace "climate-change" with "change of climate"
145	11	54	21	54	21	Delete "robust"
146	11	54	25	54	25	Replace "is very likely to" by "could"
147	11	54	28	54	28	Replace "is likely to" with "may"
148	11	54	30	54	30	Replace "is likely to" with "may"

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment
						<b>** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please <b>DOUBLE-CLICK</b> in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. Only <b>ONE</b> comment per row, please. <b>**</b></b>
149	11	54	33	54	33	Replace "likely" with "possibly"
150	11	54	34	54	34	Replace "is likely to" with "may"
151	11	54	36	54	36	Replace "will" by "might"
152	11	61	29	61	29	Delete "Robust"
153	11	61	33	61	33	Replace "are very likely to" by "could"
154	11	61	36	61	36	Replace "likely to" by "could"
155	11	61	37	61	37	Replace "is likely to" with "may"
156	11	61	38	61	38	Replace "is very likely to" by "could"
157	11	61	39	61	39	Replace "very likely" with "possibly"
158	11	61	41	61	41	Replace "consensus" with "agreement"
159	11	61	46	61	46	Replace "likely" with "possibly"
160	11	51	48	51	48	Replace "very likely" with "possible"
161	11	51	49	51	49	Replace "will very likely with "could"
162	11	51	52	51	52	Replace "likely" with ':possible'
163	11	51	54	51	54	Replace " very likely" with ':possible'
164	11	69	13	69	13	Delete "Robust"
165	11	69	17	69	17	Replace "is very likely to" by "could"
166	11	69	17	69	18	Replace "is very likely to" by "could"
167	11	69	20	69	20	Replace "is very likely to" by "could"
168	0	69	20	69	20	Replace "It is very likely that" with "it is possible that"
169	11	69	22	69	22	Delete "It is likely that"
170	11	69	22	69	22	Replace "will" by "may"
171	11	69	26	69	26	Replace "is very likely to" by "could"
172	11	72	12	72	12	Replace "investigated" by "projected"
173	11	75	20	75	20	Delete "Robust"
174	11	75	23	75	23	Replace "will likely" by "may"
175	11	75	27	75	27	Replace "are very likely to" by "may"
176	11	75	31	75	31	Replace "are very likely to" by "may"
177	11	75	33	75	33	Replace "is likely to" by "could"
178	11	75	35	75	35	Replace "are very likely to" by "may"
179	11	75	37	75	37	Replace "is likely to" by "could"
180	11	75	39	75	39	Replace "are very likely to" by "may"
181	11	75	41	75	41	Replace "is likely to" by "could"

#	Chapter	Start Page	Start Line	End Page	End Line	Comment
						<b>Comment</b> ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please <b>DOUBLE-CLICK</b> in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. Only <b>ONE</b> comment per row, please.
182	11	76	53	76	53	Replace "climate change" with "changes in climate"
183	11	111	1	111	1	Replace "climate change" with "changes in climate"
184	11	111	8	111	8	Replace "climate change" with "changes in climate"
185	11	111	21	111	21	Replace "climate change" with "changes in climate"
186	11	111	28	111	28	Replace "climate change" with "changes in climate"
187	11	136		136		The corrected figures for China are not used {see Zhou et al 2005 Acta Meteorologica Sinica Vol 19 pages 389-400}
188	11	138		138		You do not use the corrected figures for the USA (see Figure 3.2.3)