

**From:** <Andrew.Johnson@csiro.au>  
**Subject:** **FW: Climate Science - response to your email**  
**Date:** 31 March 2010 6:11:46 PM AEST  
**To:** <catalyst@eis.net.au>  
**Cc:** <Annemaree.Lonergan@csiro.au>, <Ben.Creagh@csiro.au>, <Simon.Torok@csiro.au>

---

Dear Mr Roberts

Thank you for your message. The references provided to you refer to the online version of a six page brochure "The Science of Climate Change" at <http://www.csiro.au/resources/the-science-of-climate-change-brochure.html> . I now understand that you were actually referring to the longer 32 page document "the Science of Tackling Climate Change" at <http://www.csiro.au/resources/Tackling-climate-change.html>. The references about the science referred to in the first few pages of the longer 32 page document are the same as those in the 6 page document.

Your other concerns have been noted.

Yours sincerely

Dr Andrew Johnson  
Group Executive - Environment  
CSIRO  
Queensland Bioscience Precinct  
306 Carmody Road, St Lucia Q 4068 AUSTRALIA  
Phone: 07 3214 2383; 0419 759 616  
Fax: 07 3214 2308  
<http://www.csiro.au/>

---

**From:** Malcolm Roberts [mailto:catalyst@eis.net.au]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, 31 March 2010 3:47 PM  
**To:** Johnson, Andrew (Group Exec, St. Lucia)  
**Cc:** Lonergan, Annemaree (OCE, Campbell); Creagh, Ben (CSE, St. Lucia); Torok, Simon (CMAR, Aspendale)  
**Subject:** Re: Climate Science - response to your email

Dr Andrew Johnson  
Group Executive - Environment  
Queensland Bioscience Precinct  
306 Carmody Road  
ST LUCIA QLD 4067

cc  
Dr Megan Clark  
Chief Executive  
Office of the Chief Executive  
PO Box 225  
DICKSON ACT 2602

Dear Andrew:

Thank you for your e-mail letter.

Referring to my paper letter of February 12th, 2010 to Dr Megan Clark, Chief Executive, CSIRO, thank you for answering my first question.

Thank you for your links to web sites. I had separately previously visited the site of your first link and downloaded the report. Reading it around two weeks ago showed the report contained no scientifically measured real-world causal relationship between human production of CO2 and global temperature - merely tenuous coincidences and speculation.

Your second link (to The Australian newspaper article) merely refers to the report I found at your first link.

Your third link raises questions. Can you confirm, please, that the CSIRO document to which you referred in your e-mail ('Science of Climate Change') is the same document to which I referred in my e-mail (March 25th, 2010) namely 'The Science of Tackling Climate Change'? Or is it the other, shorter more recent CSIRO document to which my e-mail referred, namely 'State of the Climate'?

After visiting the CSIRO site whose link you provided - [http://www.csiro.au/resources/Climate-is-changing--ci\\_pageNo-6.html](http://www.csiro.au/resources/Climate-is-changing--ci_pageNo-6.html) (being 'page 6 of 6'), I opened associated sites at these links:

- [http://www.csiro.au/resources/Climate-is-changing--ci\\_pageNo-5.html](http://www.csiro.au/resources/Climate-is-changing--ci_pageNo-5.html) (page 5 of 6)
- [http://www.csiro.au/resources/Climate-is-changing--ci\\_pageNo-4.html](http://www.csiro.au/resources/Climate-is-changing--ci_pageNo-4.html) (page 4 of 6)
- [http://www.csiro.au/resources/Climate-is-changing--ci\\_pageNo-3.html](http://www.csiro.au/resources/Climate-is-changing--ci_pageNo-3.html) (page 3 of 6)
- [http://www.csiro.au/resources/Climate-is-changing--ci\\_pageNo-2.html](http://www.csiro.au/resources/Climate-is-changing--ci_pageNo-2.html) (page 2 of 6)
- [http://www.csiro.au/resources/Climate-is-changing--ci\\_pageNo-1.html](http://www.csiro.au/resources/Climate-is-changing--ci_pageNo-1.html) (page 1 of 6)

Locating the first page of the document whose link you provided seems to indicate the document is entitled 'Our Climate is Changing', or possibly 'Understanding Climate Change', or that it's a 'Fact Sheet'. Further, none of these links listed the document entitled 'Science of Climate Change' that you cited in your most recent e-mail.

Could you please clarify?

Secondly, I note that you have not been able to provide any specific, scientifically measured real-world evidence that human production of CO2 caused Earth's latest, modest, cyclic rise in tropospheric temperature - and subsequent decrease to 1958 temperature. Your inability to provide evidence triggers my deeper feelings of concern because of my unmet needs for reassurance from, and confidence in, CSIRO.

Assuming evidence of causation exists in CSIRO and given CSIRO's many public statements implying human causation, I expected CSIRO's Group Executive - Environment to be able to easily cite specific evidence of causal relationship. I feel more concerned given that you are responding on behalf of CSIRO's Chief Executive.

Assuming there is such causal data at your third link, could you please identify from that site the references providing specific scientifically measured real-world causal relationship between human production of CO2 and global temperature?

Respectfully, Andrew, your letter provides no reassurance of your understanding - nor of CSIRO's understanding - of what constitutes scientific evidence, causality and scientific process. To the contrary, your letter raises concerns about CSIRO.

Your letters fail to adequately address the second and more important question raised in my letter dated February 12th, 2010 to Dr Megan Clark, CSIRO Chief Executive. As that letter stated, I seek only one piece of evidence proving causation.

To check my own understanding I will be sharing this e-mail with prominent Australian scientists.

This e-mail letter is being copied to Dr Megan Clark's assistant and to the additional people to whom you copied your e-mail - CSIRO's Ben Creagh and Simon Torok. It will be posted by Registered Mail to Dr Megan Clark and to yourself.

I look forward to you addressing my specific requests.

Malcolm Roberts  
Brisbane, Australia