Expert Reviewer: GRAY

| \# | Chapter | Start <br> Page | Start Line | End Page | End <br> Line | Comment <br> ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLECLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. Only ONE comment per row, please. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 5 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 1 | You should begin by telling us what you mean by confidence limits. I suspect that they are only one standard deviation. They should be two standard deviations to comply with the standard requirement for $95 \%$ confidence. I propose to double all your confidenve limits accordingly. |
| 2 | 5 | 2 | 3 | 2 | 3 | Replace "risen" with "periodic behaviour" |
| 3 | 5 | 2 | 4 | 2 | 5 | Replace ." $14.5 \times 10$ to the 22 Joule" on line 4 to "1998" on line 5" with " $10 \times 10$ to the 22 nd Joule from 1955 to 1980 ; folowed by a fall of $6 \times 10$ to the 22 nd Joule from 1980 to 1990 ; and a rise of $8 \times 10$ to the 22 nd KlJpule from 1980 to 2005." |
| 4 | 5 | 2 | 5 | 2 | 5 | Delete "This amount represents an average warming of" |
| 5 | 5 | 2 | 6 | 2 | 6 | Insert after "ocean" "can vary in temperature over time by as much as" |
| 6 | 5 | 2 | 9 | 2 | 9 | Replace "longer-term" by "periodic" |
| 7 | 5 | 2 | 35 | 2 | 35 | Replace "118 $\pm 19$ " by "118 $\pm 38$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 8 | 5 | 2 | 37 | 2 | 37 | Replace "42 $\pm$ " by " $42 \pm 14$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 9 | 5 | 2 | 37 | 2 | 37 | Replace " $37 \pm 7$ " by "3714", to give 95\% confidence limits |
| 10 | 5 | 2 | 42 | 2 | 42 | Replace "1.8 $\pm 0.5$ " by "1.8 $\pm 10$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 11 | 5 | 2 | 43 | 2 | 43 | Replace "1.5 $\pm 0.5$ " with "1.5 $\pm 1.0$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 12 | 5 | 2 | 44 | 2 | 44 | Replace " $3.1 \pm 0.8$ " by "3.1 $\pm 1.6$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 13 | 5 | 2 | 48 | 2 | 48 | Replace " $0.4 \pm 0.1$ " by "0.4 $\pm 0.2$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 14 | 5 | 2 | 49 | 2 | 49 | Replace "1.6 $\pm 0.6$ " by "1.6 $\pm 1.2$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 15 | 5 | 2 | 54 | 2 | 54 | Replace "1.2 $\pm 0.6$ " by "1.2 $\pm 1.2$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 16 | 5 | 3 | 1 | 3 | 1 | Replace "2.8土0.8" by "2.8土1.6", to give 95\% confidence limits |
| 17 | 5 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | Delete "change" |
| 18 | 5 | 4 | 30 | 4 | 30 | Replace "1.5 $\pm 0.5$ " with "1.5 $\pm 1.0$ ", to give 95\% confidence limits |
| 19 | 5 | 4 | 30 | 4 | 30 | Delete "average for the". You have given a total, not an average. |
| 20 | 5 | 5 | 22 | 5 | 22 | Replace "an overall trend of increrasing" with "a periodic variability in " |
| 21 | 5 | 5 | 24 | 5 | 24 | Delete "on this trend" You cannot draw a "trend" through such irregular data |
| 22 | 5 | 5 | 28 | 5 | 28 | Insert after."use". "From 1955 to 1970 there was no change. From 1970 to 1980 there was a rise of $10 \times 10$ to the 22 Joules. From 1980 to 1993 there was a fall of $5 \times 10$ to the 22 Joules". |
| 23 | 5 | 5 | 38 | 5 | 39 | Replace "increasing trends" with "periodic behaviour" |
| 24 | 5 | 6 | 6 | 6 | 6 | Replace "the linear" by "a pseudo-linear". There is no evidence that the change is linear. |
| 25 | 5 | 6 | 8 | 6 | 8 | Replace "linear" by "pseudo-linear" |
| 26 | 5 | 6 | 9 | 6 | 9 | Insert after "warmed" "since 1955" |


| \# | Chapter | Start Page | Start Line | End Page | End Line | Comment <br> ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLECLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. <br> Only ONE comment per row, please. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 27 | 5 | 6 | 17 | 6 | 17 | Replace "linear" by "pseudo-linear" |
| 28 | 5 | 6 | 25 | 6 | 25 | Replace "linear" by "pseudo-linear" |
| 29 | 5 | 9 | 35 | 9 | 35 | Replace "linear trends" with "changes". They are not "linear" |
| 30 | 5 | 19 | 43 | 19 | 43 | Replace "2.2 $\pm 0.4$ " with "2.2 $\pm 0.8$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 31 | 5 | 23 | 44 | 23 | 44 | Delete "in response to global warming" |
| 32 | 5 | 24 | 7 | 24 | 7 | Insert after "signal". "Also the measurements are biased by their predominant presence near large ports and in the Northern Hemisphere. The measurements are influenced by removal of ground water, oil and minerals, and by the effects of severe storms on measuring equipment>" |
| 33 | 5 | 24 | 16 | 24 | 16 | Replace "1.5 $\pm 0.5$ " with "1.5 $\pm 1.0$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 34 | 5 | 24 | 19 | 24 | 19 | Replace "higer" with "higher" |
| 35 | 5 | 24 | 18 | 24 | 18 | Insert after "rise" "or the influence of groundwater and mineral removel and weight of buildings" |
| 36 | 5 | 24 | 45 | 24 | 45 | Replace "1.8 $\pm 0.3$ " with"1.8 $\pm 0.6$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 37 | 5 | 24 | 49 | 24 | 49 | Replace "1.8 $\pm 0.5$ " with "1.8 $\pm 1.0$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 38 | 5 | 24 | 54 | 24 | 54 | Replace "consensus" with "opinion" |
| 39 | 5 | 24 | 56 | 24 | 56 | Delete "significantly" This word has a statistical conmnotation not presebnt here |
| 40 | 5 | 25 | 9 | 25 | 9 | Add at end "There have been, so far, very few corrections for land subsidance due to removal of groundwater and minerals, and by the weight of buildings" |
| 41 | 5 | 25 | 12 | 25 | 12 | Delete "precision" There have been many arguments about the accuracy of these measurements |
| 42 | 5 | 25 | 12 | 25 | 13 | Delete "although the road to success was paved by" We don't need this purple prose. |
| 43 | 5 | 25 | 13 | 25 | 13 | Replace "and" by "gave way to" |
| 44 | 5 | 25 | 14 | 25 | 14 | Delete "ushered in a new paradigm in satellite altimetry, largely" More purple prose.. |
| 45 | 5 | 25 | 15 | 25 | 15 | Delete "launch of the" sounds like a battleship? |
| 46 | 5 | 25 | 15 | 25 | 15 | Replace "mission" by "series" Who are you tring to convert? |
| 47 | 5 | 25 | 16 | 25 | 16 | Delete "precidion" But tell us how muc. |
| 48 | 5 | 25 | 16 | 25 | 16 | Delete "seamlessly" It is not an embroidery |
| 49 | 5 | 25 | 17 | 25 | 17 | Replace "is a reasonably straightforward exsrcise if" by "requires" |
| 50 | 5 | 25 | 18 | 25 | 18 | Delete "is" |
| 51 | 5 | 25 | 24 | 25 | 24 | Replace "+3.1 $\pm 0.8$ " with "+3.1 $\pm 1.6$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 52 | 5 | 25 | 31 | 25 | 32 | Delete from "The accuracy needed" on line 31 to "and thus" on line 32. Redundant comment |
| 53 | 5 | 25 | 39 | 25 | 39 | Delete "considered to be extremely robust" to "sea level rise of" An unnecessary statement |
| 54 | 5 | 25 | 39 | 25 | 39 | Replace "+3.1 $\pm 0.8$ " with "+3.1 $\pm 1.6$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 55 | 5 | 25 | 40 | 25 | 40 | Delete "is reliable within these error bars" I should hope so! |
| 56 | 5 | 25 | 42 | 25 | 42 | Delete "Note that" |


| \# | Chapter | Start <br> Page | Start Line | End Page | End Line | Comment <br> ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLECLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. Only ONE comment per row, please. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 57 | 5 | 25 | 44 | 25 | 44 | Replace "plausible" by "possible" |
| 58 | 5 | 25 | 45 | 25 | 45 | "This number". Which number is that, "-0.3" or "+0.15"??? |
| 59 | 5 | 25 | 48 | 25 | 48 | Delete "An important result of" |
| 60 | 5 | 25 | 48 | 25 | 48 | Replace "is" by "allows" |
| 61 | 5 | 35 | 51 | 25 | 51 | Delete "unambiguous" |
| 62 | 5 | 26 | 1 | 26 | 1 | Replace "signature" by ":influence" |
| 63 | 5 | 26 | 19 | 26 | 19 | Delete "however" |
| 64 | 5 | 26 | 23 | 26 | 23 | Replace "trends" by "changes" |
| 65 | 5 | 26 | 25 | 26 | 35 | Replace "linear" by "pseudo-linear" |
| 66 | 5 | 27 | 12 | 27 | 12 | Replace "a significant" with "an" |
| 67 | 5 | 27 | 12 | 27 | 12 | Replace "1.3 $\pm 0.6$ " with "1.3 $\pm 1.2$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 68 | 5 | 27 | 24 | 27 | 24 | Delete "significantyly" |
| 69 | 5 | 28 | 9 | 28 | 9 | Add at end "And the absence of allowances for removal of ground water, weight of buildings (such as air bases or luxury hotels) and the effects of cyclones" |
| 70 | 5 | 28 | 20 | 28 | 20 | Replace "1.9 $\pm 0.8$ " with "1.9 $\pm 1.6$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 71 | 5 | 28 | 26 | 28 | 26 | Replace "1.2 $\pm 0.8$ " with "1.2 $\pm 1.6$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 72 | 5 | 29 | 19 | 29 | 19 | Replace " $0.4 \pm 01$ " with " $0.4 \pm 0.2$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 73 | 5 | 29 | 25 | 29 | 25 | Replace "0.33 $\pm 0.08$ " with "0.33 $\pm 0.16$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 74 | 5 | 29 | 26 | 29 | 26 | Replace " $0.36 \pm 0.14$ " with " $0.36 \pm 0.28$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 75 | 5 | 29 | 32 | 29 | 32 | Replace " $0.32 \pm 0.10$ " with " $0.32 \pm 0.20$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 76 | 5 | 29 | 37 | 29 | 37 | Replace " $0.12 \pm 0.06$ " with " $0.12 \pm 0.12$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 77 | 5 | 29 | 41 | 29 | 41 | Replace " $0.42 \pm 0.14$ " with "0.42 $\pm 0.28$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 78 | 5 | 29 | 43 | 29 | 43 | Replace $1.6 \pm 0.6$ " with "1.6 $\pm 1.2$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 79 | 5 | 30 | 1 | 30 | 1 | Replace 1.5 $\pm 0.6$ " with "1.5土1.2", to give 95\% confidence limits |
| 80 | 5 | 30 | 1 | 30 | 1 | Replace 1.6 $\pm 0.6$ " with "1.6 $\pm 1.2$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 81 | 5 | 30 | 8 | 30 | 8 | Replace $0.04 \pm 0.02$ " with " $0.04 \pm 0.04$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 82 | 5 | 30 | 17 | 30 | 17 | All the confidence intervals in this Table should be doubled , for 95\% confidence |
| 83 | 5 | 30 | 45 | 30 | 45 | Delete "remarkable" |
| 84 | 5 | 31 | 4 | 31 | 4 | Replace "a significant" with "an" |
| 85 | 5 | 32 | 35 | 32 | 35 | Replace" 0.51 $\pm 0.32$ " with "051 $\pm 0.64$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 86 | 5 | 32 | 35 | 32 | 35 | Replace" $0.81 \pm 0.43$ " with "0.81 $\pm 0.43$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 87 | 5 | 32 | 37 | 32 | 37 | Replace " $0.05 \pm 0.12$ " with "0.05 $\pm 0.24$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 88 | 5 | 32 | 38 | 32 | 38 | Replace" $0.21 \pm 0.07$ " with "0.21 $\pm 0.14$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |


| \# | Chapter | Start <br> Page | Start Line | End Page | End Line | Comment <br> ** If you are cutting and pasting comments from another application into the review form, please DOUBLECLICK in the appropriate spreadsheet comment cell before pasting your comment. Only ONE comment per row, please. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 89 | 5 | 32 | 39 | 32 | 40 | Replace " $0.14 \pm 0.13$ " with " $0.14 \pm 0.82$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 90 | 5 | 32 | 40 | 32 | 40 | Replace " $0.21 \pm 0.35$ " with "0.21 $\pm 0.70$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 91 | 5 | 34 | 21 | 34 | 21 | All the figures in this Table need to double the confidence intervals to give 95\% confidence |
| 92 | 5 | 34 | 40 | 34 | 40 | Replace "very precise" by "better" |
| 93 | 5 | 34 | 42 | 34 | 42 | Insert after "of "approximately" |
| 94 | 5 | 34 | 43 | 34 | 45 | Delete from "However" on line 34 to "effects" on line 34. Don't parade your ignorance! |
| 95 | 5 | 35 | 25 | 35 | 25 | Delete "compelling" |
| 96 | 5 | 35 | 25 | 35 | 25 | Replace "increased" by "fluctuated considerably" |
| 97 | 5 | 35 | 26 | 35 | 26 | Replace "(Figure 5.6.2.)" with ",see Figure 5.6.2" |
| 98 | 5 | 50 | 2 | 50 | 3 | Start with a statement that all confidence intervals in this Chapter are for 95\% confidenve |
| 99 | 5 | 54 | 8 | 54 | 8 | Add at end "Note that such an apparently periodic graph as this cannot be considered to represent a limear trend" |
| 100 | 5 | 55 | 5 | 55 | 5 | Replace "linear" by "pseudo-linear" |
| 101 | 5 | 55 | 6 | 55 | 6 | Replace "linear" by "pseudo-linear" |
| 102 | 5 | 56 | 6 | 56 | 6 | Replace "linear" by "pseudo-linear" |
| 103 | 5 | 62 | 5 | 62 | 5 | Insert after "accuracy" "(95\% confidence)" |
| 104 | 5 | 68 | 8 | 68 | 8 | Replace "2.9 $\pm 0.40$ " with " $2.9 \pm 0.80$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 105 | 5 | 68 | 8 | 68 | 8 | Replace " $3.2 \pm 0.4$ " with " $3.2 \pm 0.8$ ", to give $95 \%$ confidence limits |
| 106 | 5 | 79 | 10 | 79 | 10 | Add at end "Note the comparatively poor coverage of the Southern oceans" |
| 107 | 5 | 80 | 5 | 80 | 5 | Delete "in Northern Hemisphere and Southern Hemisphere" It is redundant |

